





## TRANSIT ADMINISTRATIVE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE of the BUTTE COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS

Tuesday – January 11, 2011 11:00 a.m.

BCAG Conference Room 2580 Sierra Sunrise Terrace, Suite 100, Chico CA (530) 879-2468

#### 1. INTRODUCTIONS

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY ADDRESS ANY ITEM ON THE AGENDA DURING CONSIDERATION OF THAT ITEM.

#### 2. ORAL COMMUNICATION

PERSONS WISHING TO ADDRESS AGENDA ITEMS OR COMMENT ON ANY ITEM NOT ON THE AGENDA MAY DO SO AT THIS TIME. COMMENTS ARE LIMITED TO THREE MINUTES PER PERSON. PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME AND ADDRESS FOR THE RECORD.

FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA, NO ACTION WILL BE TAKEN AT THIS TIME. IF IT REQUIRES ACTION, IT WILL BE REFERRED TO STAFF AND OR PLACED ON THE NEXT AGENDA.

COPIES OF STAFF REPORTS OR OTHER WRITTEN DOCUMENTATION RELATING TO ITEMS OF BUSINESS REFERRED TO ON THE AGENDA ARE ON FILE IN THE OFFICE OF BUTTE COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS (BCAG). PERSONS WITH QUESTIONS CONCERNING AGENDA ITEMS MAY CALL BCAG TO MAKE INQUIRIES REGARDING THE NATURE OF THE ITEM DESCRIBED ON THE AGENDA.

#### **ITEMS FOR ACTION AND INFORMATION**

#### <u>STAFF</u>

3.	TAOC Minutes – May 17, 2010	Kristy Bonnifet
4.	B-Line Paratransit Supplemental Service Proposal	Kristy Bonnifet
5.	Unmet Transit Needs Assessment and Findings for FY 2011/1	2 Kristy Bonnifet
6.	Market Based Transit Study Implementation Update	Robin Van Valkenburgh
7.	2010/11 First Quarter Report for Butte Regional Transit	Robin Van Valkenburgh
8.	Other Items	





**ITEM # 3** 

#### Butte County Association of Governments Transit Administrative Oversight Committee (TAOC) <u>Draft</u> Summary Meeting Minutes For May 17, 2010

#### MEMBERS PRESENT

Frank Fields Cindy Jones Al McGreehan City of Chico Butte County Public Works Town of Paradise

#### STAFF PRESENT

Jon Clark Robin Van Valkenburgh Jim Peplow Kristy Bonnifet Julie Quinn Executive Director Senior Planner Senior Planner Assistant Planner Chief Fiscal Officer

The following minutes are a summary of the TAOC.

The Transit Administrative Oversight Committee (TAOC) meeting of the Butte County Association of Governments (BCAG) was held at the BCAG Conference Room on May 17<sup>th</sup>, located at 2580 Sierra Sunrise Terrace in Chico.

#### Item #1 – Introductions

Self introductions were made.

#### Item #2 – Oral Communication

None.

#### Item #3 – March 2010 Minutes

No comments were received. The minutes were accepted by the committee.

## Item #4 – 2010/11 Butte Regional Transit (B-Line) Annual Service Plan and Budget Outline

Staff distributed and presented an updated Draft 2010/11 Butte Regional Transit Annual Service Plan and Budget for the committee's review and comments. Staff's goal was to create a budget which will continue to provide service at current operating levels yet takes into account the need to maximize available TDA funds. The proposed budget attempts to

retain the same funding requirements as in the current 2009/10 Budget. The updated Draft B-Line Service Plan & Budget identifies a total operating budget of \$7,558,125, including contingency and capital reserve, for both fixed route service and paratransit service in the urban and rural areas of Butte County. This equates to approximately \$84,404 *less* than prior year. B-Line operates seven days a week approximately 110,000 combined annual service hours. Major changes from the 2009/10 budget were outlined and discussed. It was indicated that the largest reduction in this year's budget was fuel costs; this line item was reduced by \$125,000, based on current fiscal year expenditures.

Committee Member Jones asked if BCAG was projecting decreased fares. Staff replied the budgeted figures are based on this year's actual figures, so they are a more accurate estimate, though conservative. Staff hopes that with the implementation of the Market Based Transit Study that ridership figures will increase.

Committee Member McGreehan noted that the costs to all of the jurisdictions have gone up and inquired if they went up uniformly. Staff replied that it was done according to the accepted funding formula.

Staff requested the TAOC support staff's recommendation to the BCAG Board that they adopt the 2010/11 Annual Service Plan and Budget at their May 2010 Board meeting. The committee indicated its support.

#### Item #5 – Proposed Contract Extension for Purchased Transportation Services

The current contract with Veolia Transportation for Purchased Transportation Services is set to expire effective June 30, 2010. Based on the consistent performance and responsiveness of Veolia, staff had previously recommended the committee approve BCAG to extend the current Purchased Transportation Services contract for an additional two (2) years, as provided for in the current contract.

After working with committee members, staff is proposing the contract be extended with a onetime increase of 1.5% for the hourly fixed rate. Staff feels this would signify an awareness of the contractors' limitations in regards to labor and maintenance costs, yet would be fiscally responsible based upon the current financial state of the County. The committee concurred that this was a prudent decision.

The committee voiced their support for BCAG requesting the Board of Directors' approval of a two year contract extension with Veolia with a 1.5% increase for the fixed hourly rate.

Committee Member Jones stated that she would like to see BCAG's Capital Reserves schedule, specifically how much is contributed and the schedule for capital replacement. She would like this presented at the next TAOC meeting.

#### Item #6 – Other Items

Staff updated the committee on the status of the Market Based Transit Study as well as the installation of the AVL/GPS system on the B-Line fleet.





## BCAG Transit Administrative Oversight Committee

Item #4 Information

December 27, 2010

#### **B-LINE PARATRANSIT SUPPLEMENTAL SERVICE PROPOSAL**

PREPARED BY: Kristy Bonnifet, Associate Planner

**ISSUE:** Staff is proposing that B-Line Paratransit provide supplemental Dial-a-Ride service to areas outside the current Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) boundaries for a premium fare.

**DISCUSSION:** B-Line Paratransit currently provides service to the disabled and senior citizens within a three-quarter mile boundary of the fixed route bus system in Chico, Oroville and Paradise. This boundary is the area ADA requires complementary Paratransit service be available. Potential riders who have origins or destinations outside this designated area are unable to use B-Line Paratransit services. Due to fare limitations of the ADA and farebox recovery requirements of the Transportation Development Act (TDA), B-Line is unable to expand service to these outside areas under the current fare structure. However, potential riders have indicated they are willing to pay more if they could have expanded access to the service.

Attached is a proposal that would allow B-Line Paratransit to provide supplemental service to areas up to three miles outside the current ADA boundaries. The plan calls for three one-mile zones, each with an increasing fare. This plan should open up access to individuals outside the current service boundary, and potentially increase the farebox recovery ratio. The TDA requires that Paratransit have a minimum farebox recovery ratio of 10%. During the last FY, the farebox recovery for B-Line Paratransit was just under that 10% threshold.

The timing of the implementation of this supplemental service has been coordinated with the installation of electronic fareboxes on the paratransit vehicles as well as the Mentor AVL/GPS system, which should assist greatly in both trip scheduling and fare collections.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** None. This item is presented for information.

Key Staff: Jon Clark, Executive Director Jim Peplow, Senior Planner Robin Van Valkenburgh, Senior Planner Kristy Bonnifet, Associate Planner





## BCAG Transit Administrative Oversight Committee

Item #5 Information

January 11, 2010

#### UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS ASSESSMENT AND FINDINGS FOR FY 2010/11

**PREPARED BY:** Kristy Bonnifet, Associate Planner

**ISSUE:** BCAG is required to prepare the Unmet Transit Needs Assessment each year as the administrator of Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds for Butte County.

**DISCUSSION**: Each year, BCAG must identify any unmet public transit needs that may exist in Butte County in order to receive state funding. If unmet transit needs are found, a further determination must be made as to whether those needs are reasonable to meet. All unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet must be met before TDA funds are expended for non-transit uses, such as streets and roads.

Testimony has been collected through a series of public meetings that were held during December and compiled into an analysis report. Attached is the Draft *Unmet Transit Needs Assessment - 2011/2012*. The Assessment examines transit dependent groups, adequacy of existing transit services, a detailed summary of the public testimony received during this year's outreach process, and staff's analysis of whether the testimony meets the definitions of unmet transit needs and reasonable to meet.

The Assessment will be reviewed by the Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC), which provides a recommendation for Unmet Transit Needs Findings to the BCAG Board of Directors. If the Board determines there are unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet, the affected jurisdiction must satisfy those needs before any TDA funds may be expended for non-transit purposes.

Based on the testimony and analysis with the adopted definitions of unmet transit needs and reasonable to meet, the BCAG Board of Directors is **required** to make one of three findings:

- 1. There are no unmet transit needs,
- 2. There are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet,
- 3. There are unmet transit needs, including needs that are reasonable to meet.

#### Findings for the 2011/12 Fiscal Year

Based on the testimony received and on staff's analysis with the adopted definitions of unmet transit needs and reasonable to meet, BCAG staff is recommending that the following finding be made by the BCAG Board of Directors:

#### There are no unmet transit needs that are reasonable to meet.

This recommendation will be presented to the BCAG Board of Directors at the February 24, 2011 Board meeting. The new service is anticipated to begin on or near July 1, 2011 at which time new B-Line Schedules will also be developed.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** This item is provided for information.

Key staff: Robin Van Valkenburgh, Senior Planner Jim Peplow, Senior Planner Kristy Bonnifet, Associate Planner





## BCAG Transit Administrative Oversight Committee

### Item #6 Information

#### MARKET BASED TRANSIT STUDY IMPLEMENTATION UPDATE

**PREPARED BY:** Robin Van Valkenburgh, Senior Planner-Transit

**ISSUE:** The BCAG Board approved the Market Based Transit Study Alternative #2 plan at the June meeting. Following is an update on the plan.

**DISCUSSION:** The Market Based Transit Study plan was implemented in full on November 1, 2010.

Staff is receiving feedback from passengers regarding the changes to routes, schedules and stops; all of which will be reviewed and evaluated. Staff anticipates making minor changes to schedules and timing after obtaining rider input and reporting data over the coming months.

In general the implementation has gone well, with all routes making pull-out and drivers running the routes accurately. Information regarding the system changes made it to all the pertinent media outlets, as well as the B-Line website being updated at the same time.

Minor challenges have developed in terms of ensuring all stop schedule inserts have been updated, but this task has been addressed by staff and should no longer be an issue. Staff is also currently working on a plan to install approximately 70 new bus stop signs in association with routing updates. Staff expects all new stops to be installed within the next 3-6 months, dependent upon the complexity of the installation process (i.e. permitting, construction if needed, shelters etc.).

Passenger feedback has been both positive and negative; the positives tend to relate to the expansion of services or the updated routing while the negatives have tended to focus on timing and schedule adherence issues with routes 15, 20, 40 & 41.

The major complaints have focused on the route 15 failing to meet the promised 15 minute headways; which after approximately 1 month of service are proving to be extremely challenging to maintain. There are 2 key reasons for the on-time challenges:

- 1. The current scheduling is tight and may not provide enough leeway for the routes to remain on-time throughout the day.
- 2. There are 2 main choke points for the route: on the Esplanade at Chico High School and at 20<sup>th</sup> and MLK Parkway.

Going forward, staff will be evaluating reasonable solutions to these items.

While there have been challenges, staff has been able to successfully address a number of them, including the modification of early morning route 20 which originally was routed around the Chico Mall on every run. Based on passenger feedback, the first three runs have been re-routed to improve the commuter service and ensure that passengers remain on-time. Staff is also evaluating the modification of certain evening runs on the route 20 for similar reasons.

Staff is working diligently with Veolia to identify additional areas of improvement for all affected routes and will utilize this information when refining the route timing over the coming months.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** This item is presented for information only.

Key Staff: Robin Van Valkenburgh, Senior Planner Jim Peplow, Senior Planner Kristy Bonnifet, Associate Planner





# BCAG Transit Administrative Oversight Committee

Item #7 Information

#### 2010/11 FIRST QUARTER REPORT FOR BUTTE REGIONAL TRANSIT

PREPARED BY: Robin VanValkenburgh, Senior Planner

**ISSUE:** Staff is presenting key financial and statistical results of the First Quarter for Butte Regional Transit.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

#### FINANCIAL

The attached table presents a summary of key financial results for Butte Regional Transit's first quarter of the fiscal year. See Attachment 1. The highlights are as follows:

- Rural fixed route passenger fares have surpassed the budget and meet the required farebox ratio of 10%.
- Urban fixed route passenger fares are below budget, yet are sufficient to meet the required farebox ratio of 20%.
- Rural and Urban Paratransit fare revenues are below budget for the quarter and are not sufficient to meet the required farebox ratio of 10%.
- Expenditures in the Rural Fixed Route have increased mostly due to increases in fuel expense and allocation.
- Expenditures in the Urban Paratransit Route have increased mainly due to increased service hours, which increases Veolia contracted services.
- Net expenditures in all other funds have come in under budget.

#### OPERATING

Staff's review of the first quarter of the 2010/2011 fiscal year indicates the B-Line service is showing a general performance improvement versus the prior year for the same period. Staff bases this assessment on statistical performance elements including ridership, passengers per vehicle revenue hour (pph), total preventable accidents per 100,000 miles traveled or Accident Frequency Ratio (AFR) and complaints per passenger.

#### BCAG Transit Administrative Oversight Committee January 11, 2011– Agenda Item #7 Page 2

Of these categories, the first two (ridership and passengers per vehicle revenue hour) are broken down by service (i.e. urban fixed route, rural fixed route, urban paratransit and rural paratransit), while the other two (AFR and complaints) are generalized for the entire B-Line service. This separation helps define the overall performance challenges and improvements in the operation of the specific B-Line services and also gauges the safety and customer satisfaction of the entire system. Below are the results of staff's review of the B-Line First Quarter performance versus the prior year.

#### Rural Fixed Route

- Overall Ridership indicates an average increase of 8% versus prior year for the 1st quarter (77,698 FY09/10 vs. 83,899 FY10/11).
- Average Passengers per vehicle revenue hour (PPH) indicate a fairly flat net change approximately 1.4% (14.84 FY09/10 vs.15.40 FY10/11).
- Current farebox recovery rate is: 23.25%

#### Urban Fixed Route

- Overall Ridership indicates an approximate increase of 2% versus prior year for the 1st quarter (217,191 FY09/10 vs. 221,150 FY10/11).
- Average Passengers per vehicle revenue hour (PPH) indicate an average increase of approximately 2% (18.92 FY09/10 vs.19.11 FY10/11).
- Current farebox recovery rate is: **26.01%**

#### Rural Paratransit

- Overall ridership indicates a net increase of 2% for the 1st quarter versus prior year (15,100 FY09/10 vs. 15,426 FY10/11).
- Passengers per vehicle revenue hour (PPH) indicate a net average increase of 7% for the 1st quarter versus prior year (2.85 FY09/10 vs. 3.01 FY10/11).
- Current farebox recovery rate is: **9.15%**

#### Urban Paratransit

- Overall ridership indicates a net average increase of 14% for the 1st quarter versus prior year (12,402 FY09/10 vs. 14,157 FY10/11).
- Passengers per vehicle revenue hour (PPH) indicate a net average increase of 9% for the 1st quarter versus prior year (2.59 FY09/10 vs. 2.82 FY10/11).
- Current farebox recovery rate is: **8.65%**

#### Accident Frequency Ratio

For the first quarter, the B-Line service had a total of 4 preventable accidents while traveling a total of 388,979 miles. This equates to an AFR of 1:97,244 mi, which meets expectations.

#### **Passenger Complaints**

For the first quarter, the B-Line recorded a total of 23 complaints while providing 334,632 passenger trips. This equates to a ratio of 1 complaint per 14,549 trips, which is excellent and meets expectations.

Overall, the system is running well and is performing at or above expectations. Additionally, both paratransit services are showing increases in the rate of productivity (Passengers Per Revenue Hour-PPH) versus prior year. Unfortunately, neither paratransit sevice is meeting the mandated 10% farebox recovery rate. Staff would also like to note on-time performance for the paratransit system has remained exceptional at an average of 98.3% for the First quarter.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** This item is presented for information only.

Key Staff: Robin Van Valkenburgh, Senior Planner Julie Quinn, Chief Fiscal Officer